



https://doi.org/10.37855/jah.2021.v23i03.42

# Genome wide *in-silico* analysis of NPR1 gene family in *Citrus reticulata* and its comparison with *Arabidopsis*

#### Mobeen Ali<sup>1</sup>, Syeda Shehar Bano Rizvi<sup>1</sup>, Muhammad Shafiq<sup>1\*</sup>, Muhammad Arshad Javed<sup>1</sup>, Ahmad Ali Shahid<sup>2</sup>, Numan Ali<sup>1</sup>, Muhammad Haseeb<sup>1</sup>, Nosheen Tabassum<sup>1</sup>, Shumaila Dastgir<sup>1</sup> and Muhammad Saleem Haider<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Institute of Agricultural Sciences, University of the Punjab, Quaid-i-Azam Campus, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan. <sup>2</sup>CEMB, University of the Punjab New campus, Lahore, Pakistan. \*E-mail: shafiq.iags@pu.edu.pk

## Abstract

Nonexpresser of pathogenesis-related proteins 1 (NPR1), and its paralogue are important salicylic acid (SA) receptors that play important roles in plant defense. NPR gene family analysis has not yet been conducted in *C. reticulata*. The CrNPR1-like and AtNPR1-like protein sequences were retrieved from online genome databases and were subjected to various bioinformatics tools. This study presents the first genome-wide identification of NPR1 gene in *C. reticulata*, resulting in 7 family members. Phylogenetic analysis of 7 CrNPR1-like proteins, along with NPR1-related proteins from 15 species revealed that the proteins were grouped into three major clades. The CrNPR1-like genes in the same *Arabidopsis* subfamilies had similar protein domain compositions, number of exons and conserved motifs. All 7 *CrNPR* genes were segmented duplicated, and no tandem duplicate was observed. Transcriptome data revealed note-worthy expression in leaf, fruit and rind patterns of CrNPR1-like genes. Nearly six out of seven *CrNPR*, expressed in leaf infected with *Xylella fastidiosa*, indicates that these tissues and organs contribute to improved defense response against pathogens. These results pave the way for more functional characterization of *NPR1s* in *C. reticulate* and related species.

Key words: Biotic stress, citrus, expression profile, NPR1, phylogenetic analysis, salicylic acid

## Introduction

The mandarin orange (C. reticulata), also known as the tangerine or mandarin belongs to family, Rutaceae. It is a diploid plant with a chromosome number 2n=2x=18. C. reticulata, is generally cited as the ancestral species of cultivated mandarins (Swingle et al., 1967). It is a small, easily peeled, sweet fruit that has a high nutritional importance (Wu et al., 2018) and is a major commercial fruit crop. Satsuma mandarin and Clementine's mandarin are its two commercial varieties. Plant disease in citrus is the major cause of yield decline. Several fungal pathogens attack citrus such as Colletotrichum acutatum which causes Post bloom fruit drop; Alternaria alternata which causes Alternaria brown spot; Elsinoe fawsettii and E. australis which causes scab diseases; Diaporthe citri which causes melanose; and Mycosphaerella citri which causes greasy spot (Timmer et al., 2004). To combat pathogens such as bacteria, oomycetes, viruses and fungi, plants have developed a complex natural immunity. Salicylic acid (SA) mediated signaling pathway is necessary for defense against biotrophic and hemi-biotrophic pathogens (Glazebrook, 2005; Zhang et al., 2019). Nonexpressor of Pathogenesis-Related Proteins 1 (NPR1), and its paralogues NPR3 and NPR4, are true salicylic acid (SA) receptors that operate as vital regulators in defense response known as systemic acquired resistance which is induced by pathogens and is mediated by SA (Ding, 2018; Fu, 2012; Manohar, 2015; Wu et al., 2012). Hence, to understand the immune mechanism of C. reticulata it is important to identify and analyze NPR1-like proteins essential in the SA dependent defense response.

Plants are naturally exposed to microorganism like bacteria, fungi, viruses and nematodes. These microorganisms become pathogens when they invade the host cell, proliferate, grab nutrients and damage host cells. In fact, pathogens approaching to enter the cellular cytosol must initially overcome the first layer of plant immune system - the PAMP-triggered immunity (PTI). The receptors present on the cell membrane activate PTI responses by detection of PAMPs, such as fungal chitin, bacterial flagellin (flg22), and lipopolysaccharides (LPS) (Boutrot, 2017; Couto, 2016; Zipfel et al., 2004). However, many microbial pathogens often depress the effect of PTI and lead to effector-triggered susceptibility (ETS) (Deller, 2011; Faris, 2010; Kim et al., 2010). During evolution, plants have developed the second layer of local induced resistance, termed effector-triggered immunity (ETI) (Deller et al., 2011). Plant intracellular sensors encoded by resistance (R) genes elicit ETI responses by recognizing these attacker-specific effectors. The R gene-mediated defenses confer strong resistance and effectively restrict the growth of pathogens via. programmed cell death (PCD), designated as hypersensitive response (HR). This local immune response leads to biosynthesis and accumulation of plant defense hormone SA both at infection sites and in distal uninfected tissues, and then deployment of systemic acquired resistance (SAR) after HR in the whole plant. SAR confers a broad-spectrum, long-lasting, and systemic resistance to secondary infections, that is characterized by expression of many anti-microbial pathogenesis-related (PR) genes throughout plant's tissues (Olate, 2018; Wang et al., 2016).

Mutant screening is a sole recessive mutation of *Arabidopsis thaliana* in the mid-1990s. It displayed increased disease

susceptibility and eliminated SAR-related gene expression induced by SA- or its analog, called AtNPR1 (Cao et al., 1994), and also called AtNIM1 (Delaney et al., 1995) and AtSAI1 (Shah et al., 1997). Arabidopsis NPR1 protein plays a crucial role in systemic acquired resistance mediated by salicylic acid (SA), and is also involved in induced systemic resistance triggered by rhizobacterium (Pieterse et al., 1998), crosstalk inhibition of defense responses mediated by Jasmonic acid (Spoel et al., 2008) and cold acclimation (Olate et al., 2018). AtNPR1 has a molecular structure that contains two domains, N-terminal BTB/ POZ and central ANK repeat, that participate in protein-protein interactions and are conserved (Boyle, 2009; Rochon et al., 2006). NPR1-like gene family has six paralogues in the Arabidopsis genome (Initiative, 2000), known as AtNPR2, AtNPR3, AtNPR4, Arabidopsis BLADE-ON-PETIOLE2 (AtBOP2; also named AtNPR5), and AtBOP1 (also named AtNPR6) (Hepworth, 2005; Liu, 2005; Norberg et al., 2005). Phylogenetic analysis shows that AtNPR1-like gene family is divided into three functionally separate clades. Two family members are in each of the three clades and have functional redundancy. AtNPR1 and AtNPR2, in the first clade, are SA receptors and act as transcriptional co-activators in plant defense (Castello, 2018; Ding et al., 2018). AtNPR3 and AtNPR4, in the second clade, are also SA receptors and serve as transcriptional co-repressors in plant immune mechanism (Ding, 2018; Zhang et al., 2006). AtBOP1 and AtBOP2, in the third clade, required in plant growth and development (Hepworth, 2005; Norberg et al., 2005).

In the absence of pathogen attack, intracellular SA concentration is low and the NPR1 protein resides predominantly in the cytoplasm as an inactive oligomer formed via. intermolecular disulfide bonds (Backer et al., 2019). Furthermore, NPR3 and NPR4 are transcriptional co-repressors and interact with TGA (TGACG motif-binding factor) transcription factors (Zhang et al., 2006) to suppress transcription of SA-responsive genes in the nucleus (Ding et al., 2018). In the event of pathogen challenge, intracellular SA content becomes high quickly, resulting in conformational change of NPR1 from oligomer to monomer (Tada et al., 2008). The monomeric NPR1 is then transferred into the nucleus mediated by its C-terminal bipartite nuclear localization signal (NLS) (Kinkema et al., 2000). There, NPR1 binds SA and interacts with the same subset of TGAs to activate its transcriptional co-activator function (Ding et al., 2018). Meanwhile, NPR1 recruits CDK8 (cyclin-dependent kinase 8) and WRKY (W-box-binding factor) transcription factors to the NPR1 promoter to positively regulate its own expression (Chen et al., 2019). Moreover, SA-binding to NPR3 and NPR4 eliminates their transcriptional co-repressor activity on TGAs (Ding et al., 2018). This allows TGAs to turn on defense-related gene expression and activates defense response. In addition to pathogen invasion, exogenous application of SA or its analogs (BTH; benzothiodiazole and INA; 2,6-dichloroisonicotinic acid) could also induce the resistance mechanism in plants (An, 2011; Tripathi et al., 2019). Together, NPR1, and its paralogues NPR3 and NPR4, are all SA receptors through an antagonistic manner to finely regulate plant immune response dependent on distinct threshold levels of SA (Ding et al., 2018).

On the basis of above research, a systematic identification and analysis of NPR1-like family in *C. reticulata* is required. This study has been made possible due to a reference genome sequence published recently (Wang *et al.*, 2018). Here, the NPR1-like

family was identified in *C. reticulata* genomes. These reputed NPR1-like genes were analyzed in detail, including molecular characterization, phylogenetic classification, gene structures, protein domain compositions, conserved motifs and cis-regulatory elements. In addition, using publicly available *C. reticulata* RNA-sequencing (RNA-seq) datasets, the expression pattern of CrNPR1-like genes in various tissues/organs and under biotic stress conditions was also studied.

### **Material and methods**

Sequence data source: The NPR1-like protein sequences of Oryza sativa (Os), Lilium (LhSor), Gossypium hirsutum (Gh), Carica papaya (Cp), Glycine max (g), Vitis vinifera (Vv), Zea mays (Zm), Nicotiana tabacum (Nt), Brassica juncea (Bj), T. dicoccoide (w), Gladiolus hybridus (Gh), Brachypodium distachyon (Abd Elwahaab), Arabidopsis thaliana (At), Malus domestica (Md), Pyrus pyrifolia (Dey), were taken from the GenBank database (https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/genbank/). The genome sequences and NPR1-related protein sequences of C. reticulata were acquired from Citrus genome database (https://www.citrusgenomedb.org/blast/report/PytzEytKm).

Identification of NPR1-like genes: A BLASTP using an Arabidopsis, rice, papaya and wheat NPR1 like protein sequence was used as a query for the identification of NPR gene in the C. reticulata in proteome database (https://www.citrusgenomedb. org/blast/report/PytzEytKm). Then to confirm the presence of NPR like domains, retrieved amino acid sequences were subjected to searches at the SMART (http://smart.embl-heidelberg.de/) (Letunic, 2006; Letunic et al., 2004), and NCBI CDD (Conserved Domain Database) (https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/Structure/ cdd/wrpsb.cgi) (Marchler-Bauer, 2015; Marchler-Bauer et al., 2013) with the default parameters. The proteins lacking real ANK repeats in the central region and N-terminal BTB/POZ domain were identified and excluded. Overall, 7 putative NPR1like sequences were detected in the C. reticulata genome. Gene structure (Exton-Intron) was visualized in the GSDS (Gene Structure Display Server) (http://gsds.cbi.pku.edu.cn/) (Guo, 2007; Hu et al., 2015) by loading both NPR coding sequences and corresponding genomic sequences. The protein length (amino acid residues), molecular weight, and theoretical pI of CrNPR proteins were predicted using ProtParam tool (http://web.expasy. org/protparam/) (Garg et al., 2016). The information for gene IDs, chromosomal position, sequence of gene and protein, were retrieved from C. reticulata proteome database at (https://www. citrusgenomedb.org/blast/report/PytzEytKm). These CrNPR genes were renamed according to the order of their physical position.

Subcellular localization analysis, promoter prediction and conserved motifs recognition: The nuclear localization signals in *C. reticulata NPR* proteins were predicted through an online server NLSdb (https://rostlab.org/services/nlsdb/) (Bernhofer *et al.*, 2018). Subcellular localization of *CrNPR* was predicted using the online tool WoLF PSORT (https://wolfpsort.hgc.jp/) (Horton *et al.*, 2006). For analysis of promoter region, a sequence of 1000-bp upstream was retrieved from initiation codon of the putative CrNPR genes. Plant Care database (http://bioinformatics.psb.ugent.be/webtools/plantcare/html/) was then used to predict *cis*-regulatory elements in these sequences and validated in the PLACE databases (http://www.dna.affrc.go.jp/PLACE/). Multiple

EM for Motif Elicitation (MEME) program (http://meme.nbcr.net/meme/) was used to analyze with the concluded protein sequences of the *CrNPR* with maximum number of motifs set as 10. The minimum 6 width of motif and maximum 50 width of motif were set as default values along with other factors.

**Multiple sequence alignment and phylogenetic tree construction:** The amino acid sequences of *CrNPR* proteins were aligned using Clustal W version 2.1 (Thompson *et al.*, 2002) and phylogeny through MEGA v x.0 (http://www.megasoftware.net) program with the neighbor joining (NJ) and bootstrapping set at 1000 replications. There were 7 CrNPR, 6 *Arabidopsis (At)*, 4 *Oryza sativa (Os)*, 2 *Glycine max* (g) 1 *Lilium* (LhSor), 1 *Gossypium hirsutum* (Gh), 1 *Carica papaya* (Cp), *1 Vitis vinifera* (Vv), 1 *Zea mays* (Zm), 1 *Nicotiana tabacum* (Nt), 1 *Brassica juncea* (Bj), 1 *T.dicoccoide* (w), 1 *Gladiolus hybridus* (Gh), 1 *Brachypodium distachyon* (Abd Elwahaab), 1 *Malus domestica* (Md), 1 *Pyrus pyrifolia* (Dey) and 1 *Ipomoea batatas* (Ib) NPR protein sequences were used for phylogenetic analysis. Two genes from distinct species on adjacent branches of same clade in the phylogenetic tree were defined as orthologs.

Gene duplication, chromosome location and calculation of nonsynonymous (Ka) and synonymous (Ks) substitution rates: Gene pairs of *CrNPR1* were generated using the phylogenetic, motif and domain analysis data and used to compute the Ka and Ks substitution rates with tbtools (Chen *et al.*, 2020). Gene pairs along with CDS sequence and protein sequence of NPR1 like genes of *C. reticulata* were used. The molecular evolutionary rates of every single gene pair were ascertained by evaluating Ka/Ks ratio. Usually, Ka/Ks < 1 signifies purifying selection; Ka/Ks = 1 signifies neutral selection; and Ka/Ks > 1 signifies positive selection. The divergence time of these gene pairs was measured approximately by applying the formula "t = Ks/2r", with r ( $1.5 \times 10^{-8}$ ) denoting neutral substitution. MG2C (http://mg2c.iask.in/mg2c\_v2.0/) was utilized to map the CrNPR1-like genes on scaffolds to display their distribution. The duplicated genes were marked with line joining on the map.

**Percent amino acid identity in CrNPR Gene:** Percent amino acid identity between sequences was determined by the MegAlign program of the Lasergene software package version 7.2.1 (Burland *et al.*, 2000).

**Expression analysis:** PlantGDB (http://www.plantgdb.org/) expressed sequence tag (EST) in-silico investigation was performed from the identified CrNPR1-like genes to estimate their expression status in various important *C. reticulata* plant tissues and organs. The CDS sequences of each NPR1 gene were used to derive the EST information using Blastn search with the default parameter and e-value=1e-04. Finally, a heatmap using tbtool (Chen *et al.*, 2020) was created to characterize the particular NPR gene expression into various tissues and organs in *C. reticulata*.

CrNPR FPKM gene expression data from a staygreen mutant of citrus and its wild type was retrieved from NCBI gene expression omnibus (accession number is GSE94810). A heatmap of the FPKM values was made using tbtools (Chen *et al.*, 2020).

**miRNA expression dataset in** *C. reticulata*: We obtained microRNA (miRNA) sequences of *C. reticulata* from NCBI Gene Expression Omnibus (accession number is GSE116095) and published articles. NPR genes targeted by miRNAs were predicted by searching their CDS regions for complementary sequences using the psRNATarget server with default parameters, (E) = 4.0 (http://plantgrn.noble.org/psRNATarget/home).

## **Results and discussion**

Identification, phylogeny and characterization of NPR1-Like genes in *C. reticulata*: The 7 putative NPR1-like genes in *C. reticulata* genome were distinguished using bioinformatic tools (Table 1). Phylogenetic grouping can possibly provide a source for comprehending functional diversity of the NPR1-like family since individual phylogenetic analysis fails to satisfactorily perform functional annotation (Abd Elwahaab, 2019; Drillon *et al.*, 2020). A 32 NPR sequence unrooted phylogenetic tree (7 CrNPR, 6 atNPR, 4 *OSNPR*, 2 *GmNPR*, 1 LhSorNPR, 1 GhNPR, 1 CpNPR, *I* VvNPR, 1 ZmNPR, 1 NtNPR, 1 BjNPR, 1TdNPR, 1 *GhNPR*, 1 BdNPR, 1 MdNPR, 1 PpNPR and 1 IbNPR) was constructed using Mega-X (Kumar *et al.*, 2016). Theses NPRs of six monocots and nine dicots from published materials were acquired through molecular cloning techniques (Ali, 2017; Olate *et al.*, 2018). The results showed that the NPR1-like proteins were grouped into three major clades; Clade I (AtNPR3/4 subfamily) containing OsNPR2/3, GmNPR1, MdNPR1 etc., Clade II (AtBOP1/2 subfamily) containing OsNPR5 AND CrNPR8 and clade III (AtNPR1/2 subfamily) containing OsNPR1 Wnpr1 etc. Clade I contained CrNPR2, CrNPR3, CrNPR4, CrNPR5 and CrNPR6 (Fig. 1).

E.R., E.R.\_plas, plas, cyto, chlo, nucl, mito Table 1. Information about 7 non-redundant NPR1-like genes discovered from the genome of C. reticulata Notes: AA, amino acid sequence length; MW, molecular weight; pl, isoelectric point E.R., chlo, nucl, vacu, cyto, mito nucl, cyto\_nucl, chlo, cyto, plas nucl, cyto\_nucl, cyto cyto, nucl chlo, mito LOP chlo 7.45 8.74 6.28 6.31 5.9 5.7 5.8 pI 89049.19 47346.89 63352.37 49421.35 65789.71 65938.7 65764.77 MW Intron Ξ 3 m  $\mathbf{c}$  $\sim$ Length of mRNA 69428 20268 2238 3267 9064 4206 2671 416 AA 565 800 448 592 585 587 \_cov86 \_cov86 cov86 cov86 scaffold86042\_cov89 scaffold85940 cov86 scaffold85959\_cov71 scaffold85940 scaffold85940 scaffold85940 scaffold86089 Scaffold 1668069..1688336 546236..1555299 1596698..1666125 1562898..1565135 Scaffold Location 900842..904108 345601..349806 452682..455352 Ciclev10007832m.g Ciclev10017873m.g Ciclev10033533m.g Ciclev10031343m.g Ciclev10031627m.g Ciclev10031258m.g Ciclev10031432m.g PLAZA DB Accession Number MSYJ077460 1 MSYJ281950\_1 MSYJ281940 1 MSYJ131960 MSYJ281930 MSYJ281960 MSYJ287170 CitrusGDB **CrNPR1 CrNPR2 CrNPR3** CrNPR4 **CrNPR6** CrNPR5 CrNPR8 NPR1 Gene

Journal of Applied Horticulture (www.horticultureresearch.net)



Fig. 1. Polygenetic tree of NPR1 like proteins in *C. reticulata* and its homologous in *O. sativa* (Os), *Lilium* (LhSor), *G. hirsutum* (Gh), *C. papaya* (Cp), *G. max* (g), *V. vinifera* (Vv), *Z. mays* (Zm), *N. tabacum* (Nt), *B. juncea* (Bj), *T. dicoccoide* (w), *G. hybridus* (Gh), *B. distachyon* (Abd Elwahaab), *A. thaliana* (At), *M. domestica* (Mp), and *P. pyrifolia* (Dey).

All of the clade I NPR1-LIKE genes except CrNPR2 are on the same scaffold that is scaffold85940\_cov86. Clade II contained CrNPR8 which is on scaffold86089\_cov86 and clade III contained CrNPR1 which is on scaffold85959\_cov71 (Figure S1). CrNPR proteins had a sequence length that ranged from 800 (CrNPR5) to 416 (CrNPR6) amino acids. The average isoelectric point of CrNPR members was a weakly acidic value of 6.6, generally it varied from 5.7 (CrNPR2) to 8.74 (CrNPR6). The

molecular weight ranged from 89049.19 (CrNPR5) to 47346.89 (CrNPR6) with an average value of 63808.99714 (Table 1).

Sequence and structural analysis of CrNPR1-like genes and proteins: Utilizing GSDS and NCBI-CDD the structural feature and sequence composition were analyzed to further study the potential functions of CrNPR1-like genes. The exon-intron structure of CrNPR1-like genes was similar to the corresponding AtNPR1-LIKE genes (Fig. 2). Clade III, CrNPR1 and AtNPR1/2 had 4 exons and 3 introns. Although AtNPR3/4 in clade I also had 4 exons and 3 introns only CrNPR2 and CrNPR3 had similar exonintron structure. The rest of NPR1-like genes had a different number of exons. Moreover, in clade II the exon-intron structure of CrNPR8 is different from its complementary AtBOP1/2 (Fig. 2). Furthermore, CrNPR6 and AtNPR5-6 have similar exon/ intron structure pattern while CrNPR4 and CrNPR5 contained extra intron and exon which could either be an assembly error or a unique aspect of these gene.

Furthermore, only 7 CrNPR1like genes contained central

ankyrin and N-terminal BTB/POZ domains like AtNPR1 as demonstrated by the protein composition (Fig. 3). In addition, all NPR1-LIKE genes except NPR8 included the NPR1-like C-terminal region that was vital for AtNPR1 activity (Rochon *et* al., 2006).





 Okb
 ikb
 2kb
 3kb
 4kb
 6kb
 7kb
 8kb
 9kb
 10kb
 12kb
 13kb
 14kb
 15kb
 16kb
 19kb
 20kb

 Fig. 2. Phylogenetic relationship and gene structure of NPR1 genes from C. reticulata and A. thaliana. The phylogenetic tree was constructed using full length sequences of CrNPR1-like genes and AtNPR1-like genes. Yellow boxes indicate exons; and black lines indicate introns

Journal of Applied Horticulture (www.horticultureresearch.net)



Fig. 3. The domain patterns of putative NPR1-Llike genes in *C. reticulata* and *A. thaliana* interlinked with phylogenetic tree for better understanding

Motif 2 are ankyrin repeats, motif 4 is BTB/POZ domains, motif 5 is DUF3420 and motif 6 is NPR1\_like\_C (Table S1). The information of motif 3 was not found. On analyzing the motifs in NPR1-like proteins in *A. thaliana* and then comparing them with the motifs in CrNPR proteins it was found that they had the same kind of motifs conserved which made them putative NPR1-like proteins (Fig. 5).

Analysis of cis-regulatory elements in the promoter sequences of CrNPR1-like genes and sub-cellular localization analysis: By interacting with transcription factors cis-regulatory elements control the expression of plant genes (Priest et al., 2009). So, to further understand the regulatory expression, potential cis-regulatory elements in the promoter region of CrNPR1-LIKE genes were identified. For SA-responsive cis-regulatory identification 1000-bp upstream promoter sequences of CrNPR1like genes were selected and submitted to the Plant CARE online service (http://bioinformatics.psb.ugent.be/webtools/plantcare/ html/). The promoter sequences of only three CrNPR1-like genes, CrNPR1, CrNPR2 and CrNPR8, were found. The analysis showed that majority of the CrNPR1-like gene's promoters contained CAAT box and is a hormone related regulatory elements. MYB which is involved in the ABA response was also in most of the promoter sequences. Only CrNPR1 had as-1 (The activation sequence-1) element (TGACG) required in transcription activation of various SA-regulated PR genes (Fig. 2).

In the sub-cellular localization analysis, it was revealed that cytoplasm, nucleus and chloroplast had the higher number of CrNPR1-like genes. CrNPR1, CrNPR2 and CrNPR3 were in (*K* s = 4.58) for paralogous group *CrNPR1/CrNPR2* to 7.18 Mya (*K* s = 0.21) for *CrNPR4/CrNPR5*. In 6 pairs of paralogous groups the *Ka* /*Ks* ratio was more than 0.3 suggesting the possibility of existence of significant functional divergence after duplication events and 9 pairs had *KA* /*K* s ratio <0.3 signifying no functional divergence (Fig. 7).

duplications of the paralogous

pairs ranged from 152.79 Mya

**Percent amino acid identity:** Percent amino acid identity between the predicted amino acid sequences of CrNPR1 homologues and the Arabidopsis NPR1 homologues ranged from 81.2 % (CrNPR8 vs AtNPR5) to 20.8 % (CrNPR5 vs AtNPR6), whereas amino acid identity among the *C. reticulata* NPR1 homologues ranged from 20.5 % (CrNPR5 vs CrNPR8) and 75.6 % (CrNPR4 vs CrNPR5). A similar percent amino acid identity was found among Arabidopsis NPR1 sequences (Yuan, 2007; Zhong *et al.*, 2015) (Table 2).

**Expression analysis of CrNPR1-like genes in various tissues/ organs:** In order to further study the characteristics and functions of the CrNPR gene family, the expression patterns of CrNPR gene family members in different tissues were analyzed by EST analysis at Plant genome dB (Fig. 8) and CrNPR FPKM gene expression data from a staygreen mutant of citrus (Alos *et al.*, 2008) and its wild type NCBI GEO (accession number is GSE94810). A heatmap of the FPKM values was made using tbtools (Fig. 9) (Chen *et al.*, 2020). Expressed sequence tags (EST) data analysis revealed that several NPR1 genes were expressed in numerous important tissues and organs in *C. reticulata*. It suggested that NPR gene families showed substantial and noteworthy expression



Fig. 4. The distribution of 10 motifs presents in 7 NPR proteins of *C. reticulata* by using MEME version 4.9.0 and interlinking it with CrNPR phylogenetic tree to develop a good understanding of their association

in leaf, fruit and rind (Fig. 8). It is however observed that almost all members of CrNPR1-like gene family exhibited their expression at least in one tissue or organ. However, CrNPR8 was not expressed in any tissue or organ in C. reticulata. Nearly 85 % NPR genes of all 7, expressed in leaf infected with Xylella fastidiosa (Souza et al., 2007) (Fig. 8). This surely indicates that these tissues and organs contribute to improved defense response against bacterial pathogens. Among the NPR1-like gene members, CrNPR3, CrNPR4, CrNPR5, CrNPR6 exhibited in leaf (X. fastidiosa), fruit (Development stadium), Clementine Mandarin albedo/ rind separation and leaf (greenhouse). CrNPR1 only had leaf (X. fastidiosa) expression. The results suggest that SAR, the defense response, mainly occurs in leaf and fruit. It takes place to a lesser extent in the rind.

Since high-throughput RNA sequencing and gene expression analyses have been performed on many citrus tissues at various developmental stages, publiclyavailable RNA-Seq data is thought to be useful resources for studying gene expression profiles. Distinct transcript abundance patterns were readily identifiable in the RNA-Seq dataset at NCBI. The heatmap of expression profiles of CrNPR1-like genes in NCBI GEO (accession number is GSE94810) are presented in Fig. 9. This data is from the flavedo of the citrus wild type and stay green mutant fruit that were collected at 210 days after flowering and 30 days after storage for RNA extraction and analysis. Fruit showed that there was high gene expression in CrNPR3, CrNPR4, CrNPR6 and CrNPR8. CrNPR5 had no gene expression. Overall,

Clade	Gene la	IVIOLIIS										
A	AtNPR1	BTB7		BTB4	3		5	AR2	AR1	NLC6	10	8
	AtNPR2	BTB7		BTB4	3		5	AR2	AR1	NLC6	10	8
	CrNPR1	BTB7		BTB4	3		5	AR2	AR1	NLC6	10	8
В	CrNPR8	BTB7		BTB4	3	9	5	AR2	AR1	NLC6		
	AtNPR5	BTB7		BTB4	3	9	5	AR2	AR1	NLC6		
	AtNPR6	BTB7		BTB4	3	9	5	AR2	AR1	NLC6		
C	AtNPR3	BTB7		BTB4	3	9	5	AR2	AR1	NLC6	10	8
	AtNPR4	BTB7		BTB4	3	9	5	AR2	AR1	NLC6	10	8
	CrNPR2	BTB7		BTB4	3	9	5	AR2	AR1	NLC6	10	8
	CrNPR3	BTB7		BTB4	3	9	5	AR2	AR1	NLC6	10	8
	CrNPR4	BTB7		BTB4	3	9	5	AR2	AR1	NLC6	10	8
	CrNPR5		8	BTB4	3	9	5	AR2	AR1	NLC6	10	8
	CrNPR6			BTB4	3	9	5	AR2	AR1	NLC6		

Fig. 5. The heatmap shows the comparison of the motifs pattern of NPR1-like proteins in C. reticulata and A. thaliana

Tab	le 2	2.1	Percen	t simi	larity	of	CrN	PR	1-	like	protei	n se	equence	e of	C	reticul	lata	and	A.t	hali	ana.
-----	------	-----	--------	--------	--------	----	-----	----	----	------	--------	------	---------	------	---	---------	------	-----	-----	------	------

CrNPR1	CrNPR2	CrNPR3	CrNPR4	CrNPR5	CrNPR6	CrNPR8	AtNPR1	AtNPR2	AtNPR3	AtNPR4	AtNPR5	AtNPR6	
***	44.1	38.8	30.3	30.1	34.1	24.8	53.5	51.6	40.5	40.6	22.2	24.8	CrNPR1
	***	59.5	46.7	42.8	49.8	27.9	38.8	36.8	59.7	57.8	23.8	27.2	CrNPR2
		***	68.3	65.4	66.3	29	32.3	31.1	46.9	49.8	25.7	26.1	CrNPR3
			***	75.6	68	27	28.7	28.1	38.4	40.2	23.8	25.7	CrNPR4
				***	66.1	20.5	27.7	26.2	36.3	38	19.8	20.8	CrNPR5
					***	22.1	31	30.5	41.3	43.3	20.9	21.4	CrNPR6
						***	24.8	21.2	25.9	25.7	81.2	76.8	CrNPR8
							***	61.4	35.7	36.4	20	21.2	AtNPR1
								***	35.8	37.5	18.9	22.9	AtNPR2
									***	71.8	24.2	25.1	AtNPR3
										***	24.4	25.7	AtNPR4
											***	82.9	AtNPR5
												***	AtNPR

Journal of Applied Horticulture (www.horticultureresearch.net)



Fig. 6. The sub-cellular presence of putative NPR1-Llike genes in *C. reticulata* interlinked with phylogenetic tree for better understanding of different gene function and similarity



Fig. 7. Time of gene duplication estimated for different paralogous pairs of *C. reticulata* NPR1 like genes on the basis of Ks and Ka values. Analyses were conducted using the tbtools (Chen *et al.*, 2020)

the highest gene expression was in CrNPR4 whereas the lowest gene expression was in CrNPR1 (Fig. 9).

**miRNA expression dataset in** *C. reticulata*: In the analysis 7 miRNA were identified which were related to 6 CrNPR1-like genes. No miRNA target was found for CrNPR2. Each of the CrNPR1-like sequences with identified miRNAs had at least 1 matched sequence. While CrNPR4 had 4 miRNA sequence matches in its sequence. The sequences and other details of the above mentioned miRNAs is given in Table 3.

NPR like proteins is involved in different defense and signaling pathways in different plant species (Ali, 2017; Olate *et al.*, 2018).

This study is the first genome wide investigation of the *NPR1*-like gene family in *C. reticulata*, comparable to other plant species, like *O. sativa* (Yuan *et al.*, 2007) and *A. thaliana* (Hepworth *et al.*, 2005) which have 4 and 6 NPRs, respectively. This analysis sets the foundation for further functional characterization of the NPR1-like protein family in *C. reticulata*. The phylogenetic tree of the seven CrNPRs showed that NPR-like genes were unevenly distributed in 3 clades with majority of the genes in clade I (Fig. 1) (Table 4).

The *C. reticulata* genome contains seven identifiable *NPR1*-like genes; these sequences share similar gene structures and protein sequence identities as well as conserved domains and motifs present in *Arabidopsis NPR1*-like sequences (Backer *et al.*, 2015).

It shows that two main clades, NPR and BOP, arise from a progenitor gene of NPR1-like family through duplication and differentiation (Liu *et al.*, 2005). Then, the ancestor NPR gene might go through a second series of duplication event resulting in the NPR1/2 and the NPR3/4 clades. The ancient duplication events leading to functional divergence of NPR1-like genes probably happened before the monocot-dicot split because the aforementioned 6 monocots and 9 dicots have at least one member in each clade (Shia *et al.*, 2013). The current state of each clade may have been achieved by another series of duplication event after the monocot-dicot split. For example, six NPRs (AtNPR1/AtNPR2, AtNPR3/AtNPR4, and AtBOP1/AtBOP2) in *Arabidopsis* and seven NPRs (CrNPR1, CrNPR2/CrNPR3/NPR4/CrNPR5/CrNPR6 and CrNPR8) in *C. reticulata*.



Fig. 8. The heat map shows the EST expression profile of the CrNPR1like genes in different organs in *C. reticulata*. The x-axis represents names of the four parts of *C. reticulata*, and the y-axis represents different CrNPR1-like genes. The expression levels of CrNPR genes are revealed by different colors, which increase from blue to red

Journal of Applied Horticulture (www.horticultureresearch.net)



Fig. 9. The heatmap expression profile of *C. reticulata* NPR like genes across wild type and stay green mutant oranges. X-axis shows 12 samples and the putative CrNPR1-like genes on the y-axis. The FPKM values are revealed by different colors and increase from green to red. The source of the samples is as follow: WT210DAF (Wild type 210 Day after flowering), MT210DAF: (Mutant 210 Day after flowering), WT210DAS (Wild type 210 Day after storage) and MT210DAS (Wild type 210 Day after storage)

miRNA id	Gene Id	Ref_Seq	Alignment	RPM
orange-MIR473-81	CrNPR5	ACUCUCCCUCAAGGGCUUCGC	miRNA 211	277.2611
			Target 18171837	
orange-MIR473-81	CrNPR4	ACUCUCCCUCAAGGGCUUCGC	miRNA 211	277.2611
			Target 11121132	
orange-MIR477b-97	CrNPR5	CUCUCCCUCAAGGGCUUCUCU	miRNA 211	197.6596
			Target 18161836	
orange-MIR477b-97	CrNPR4	CUCUCCCUCAAGGGCUUCUCU	miRNA 211	197.6596
			Target 1111131	
orange-MIR166g-15	CrNPR1	GGAAUGUUGUCUGGCUCGAGG	miRNA 211	220.4029
			Target 570590	
orange-MIR390a-4	CrNPR4	AAGCUCAGGAGGGAUAGCGCC	miRNA 211	253.2773
			Target 454474	
orange-MIR473-81	CrNPR6	ACUCUCCCUCAAGGGCUUCGC	miRNA 211	277.2611
			Target 10011021	
orange-MIR477b-97	CrNPR6	CUCUCCCUCAAGGGCUUCUCU	miRNA 211	197.6596
			Target 10001020	
orange-MIR482a-80	CrNPR4	AGUGGGAGCGUGGGGUAAGAAG	miRNA 221	25.63786
			Target 14731494	
orange-MIR390a-4	CrNPR5	AAGCUCAGGAGGGAUAGCGCC	miRNA 211	253.2773
			Target 11591179	
orange-MIR477b-97	CrNPR3	CUCUCCCUCAAGGGCUUCUCU	miRNA 211	197.6596
			Target 12041224	
orange-MIR482b-110	) CrNPR8	UCUUGCCCACCCCUCCCAUUCC	miRNA 221	4053.056
			Target 631652	
orange-MIR535-20	CrNPR1	UGACAACGAGAGAGAGAGCACGC	miRNA 211	10.75136
			Target 15091529	

Additionally, the structural and sequence features of CrNPR also support the phylogenetic analysis. CrNPR3 and CrNPR2 have 3 introns each which is the same number of introns as AtNPR3 and AtNPR4 that are in the same clade. Similarly, NPR1 and AtNPR1/2 on Clade III share similar exon-intron structure. On the other hand, NPRs in clade II have different number of introns. However, all the CrNPR proteins contain Ank and BTB/POZ domains. Only NPR8 in clade II does not harbor NPR-like C terminal region. organ-specific expression patterns (Barsalobres-Cavallari, 2009; Yang *et al.*, 2013). CrNPRs demonstrated specific expression in the leaf, fruit and rind in the in-silico assessment of RNAseq experiments. This suggests that they may participate in development and protecting the seed for plant propagation.

CrNPR1-like gene expressions were examined by investigating the expression profiles of CrNPR1-like genes upon biotic stresses. In orange fruit in response to the application of the antagonist all of the CrNPRs were expressed at different FPKMs (Fig. 9).

Biological functions in a plant are usually reflected by the tissue/

Journal of Applied Horticulture (www.horticultureresearch.net)

Group	Numl NPR	per of Gene	Gene Id						
	At	Cr	At	Cr					
A	2	1	AtNPR1, AtNPR2	CrNPR1					
В	2	1	AtNPR5, AtNPR6	CrNPR8					
С	2	5	AtNPR3, AtNPR4	CrNPR2, CrNPR3, CrNPR4, CrNPR5, CrNPR6					

 Table 4. C. reticulata NPR gene family distribution among clades and groups based on phylogenetic analysis with Arabidopsis NPR member

Altogether, these putative NPR1-like genes could be used as the preferred genes to prove their biological functions through molecular experiments in development and defense.

A total of 7 NPR1-like genes were identified from *C. reticulata*. The CrNPR1-like genes were studied in depth, comprising protein domain compositions, molecular characterization, gene structures, phylogenetic classification and conserved motifs, as well as cisregulatory elements. CrNPR1-like genes displayed particular tissue/organ specific expression patterns based on RNA-seq data. These findings will be beneficial in planning experiments to assess the biological functions and understand the evolutionary relationship of the NPR1-like gene family in *C. reticulata*.

#### References

- Ali, S., Z.A. Mir, A. Tyagi, H. Mehari, R.P. Meena, J.A. Bhat, P. Yadav, P. Papalou, S. Rawat and A. Grover, 2017. Overexpression of NPR1 in *Brassica juncea* confers broad spectrum resistance to fungal pathogens. *Front. Plant Sci.*, 8: 1693.
- Alos, E., M Roca, D.J. Iglesias, M.I. Minguez-Mosquera, C.M. Damasceno, T.W. Thannhauser, J.K. Rose, M. Talon and M. Cercos, 2008. An evaluation of the basis and consequences of a stay-green mutation in the navel negra citrus mutant using transcriptomic and proteomic profiling and metabolite analysis. *Plant Physiol.*, 147(3): 1300-1315.
- An, C. and Z. Mou, 2011. Salicylic acid and its function in plant immunity. J. Integr. Plant Biol., 53(6): 412-428.
- Aravind, L. and E.V. Koonin, 1999. Fold prediction and evolutionary analysis of the POZ domain: Structural and evolutionary relationship with the potassium channel tetramerization domain. J. Mol. Biol., 285(4): 1353-1361.
- Backer, R., W. Mahomed, B.J. Reeksting, J. Engelbrecht, E. Ibarra-Laclette and van den Berg, N. (Manohar)2015. Phylogenetic and expression analysis of the NPR1-like gene family from *Persea americana* (Mill.). *Front. Plant Sci.*, 6: 300.
- Barsalobres-Cavallari, C.F., F.E. Severino, M.P. Malufand and I.G. Maia, 2009. Identification of suitable internal control genes for expression studies in *Coffea arabica* under different experimental conditions. *BMC Mol. Biol.*, 10: 1.
- Bernhofer, M., T. Goldberg, S. Wolf, M. Ahmed, J. Zaugg, M. Boden and B. Rost, 2018. NLSdb-major update for database of nuclear localization signals and nuclear export signals. *Nucleic Acids Res.*, 46: D503-D508.
- Boutrot, F. and C. Zipfel, 2017. Function, discovery, and exploitation of plant pattern recognition receptors for broad-spectrum disease resistance. *Annu. Rev. Phytopathol.*, 55: 257-286.
- Boyle, P.S., E.L. Rochon, A. Shearer, H.L. Murmu, J. Chu, J.Y. Fobert, P.R. Despres, C., 2009. The BTB/POZ domain of the Arabidopsis disease resistance protein NPR1 interacts with the repression domain of TGA2 to negate its function. *Plant Cell*, 21(11): 3700-3713.
- Burland, T.G. 2000. DNASTAR's Lasergene sequence analysis software. Methods Mol. Biol., 132: 71-91.
- Cao, H., J. Glazebrook, J.D. Clarke, S. Volko and X. Dong, 1997. The Arabidopsis NPR1 gene that controls systemic acquired resistance encodes a novel protein containing ankyrin repeats. *Cell*, 88(1): 57-63.

- Cao, H., S.A. Bowling, A.S. Gordon and X. Dong, 1994. Characterization of an Arabidopsis mutant that is nonresponsive to inducers of systemic acquired resistance. *Plant Cell*, 6(11): 1583-1592.
- Castelló, M.J., L. Medina-Puche, J. Lamilla and P. Tornero, 2018. NPR1 paralogs of Arabidopsis and their role in salicylic acid perception. *PLoS ONE*, 13(12): e0209835.
- Chen, C., Chen, H., Zhang, Y., Thomas, H. R., Frank, M. H., He, Y. and Xia, R., 2020. TBtools: An integrative toolkit developed for interactive analyses of big biological data. *Mol. Plant.*, 13: 1194-1202.
- Chen, J., R. Mohan, Y. Zhang, M. Li, H. Chen, I.A. Palmer, M. Chang, G. Qi, S.H. Spoel, T. Mengiste, D. Wang, F. Liu and Z.Q. Fu, 2019. NPR1 promotes its own and target gene expression in plant defense by recruiting CDK8. *Plant Physiol.*, 181(1): 289-304.
- Couto, D. and C. Zipfel, 2016. Regulation of pattern recognition receptor signalling in plants. *Nat. Rev. Immunol.*, 16(9): 537-52.
- Delaney, T.P., L. Friedrich and J.A. Ryals, 1995. Arabidopsis signal transduction mutant defective in chemically and biologically induced disease resistance. *Proc. Natl. Acad Sci.*, 92(14): 6602-6606.
- Deller, S., K.E. Hammond-Kosack and J.J. Rudd, 2011. The complex interactions between host immunity and non-biotrophic fungal pathogens of wheat leaves. J. Plant Physiol., 168: 63-71.
- Ding, Y., T. Sun, K. Ao, Y. Peng, Y. Zhang, X. Li and Y. Zhang, 2018. Opposite roles of salicylic acid receptors NPR1 and NPR3/NPR4 in transcriptional regulation of plant Immunity. *Cell.*, 173(6): 1454-1467.
- Drillon, G., R. Champeimont, F. Oteri, G. Fischer and A. Carbone, 2020. Phylogenetic reconstruction based on syntemy block and gene adjacencies. *Mol. Biol Evol.*, 37: 2747-2762.
- Durrant, W.E. and X. Dong, 2004. Systemic acquired resistance. Annu Rev Phytopathol., 42: 185-209.
- Faris, J. D., Z. Zhang, H. Lu, S. Lu, L. Reddy, S. Cloutier, J.P. Fellers, S.W. Meinhardt, J.B. Rasmussen, S.S. Xu, R.P. Oliver, K.J. Simons and T.L. Friesen, 2010. A unique wheat disease resistance-like gene governs effector-triggered susceptibility to necrotrophic pathogens. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA.*, 107(30): 13544-9.
- Fu, Z.Q. S. Yan, A. Saleh, W. Wang, J. Ruble, N. Oka, R. Mohan, S.H. Spoel, Y. Tada and N. Zheng, 2012. NPR3 and NPR4 are receptors for the immune signal salicylic acid in plants. *Nature*, 486(7402): 228-232.
- Garg, V.K., H. Avashthi, A. Tiwari, P.A. Jain, P.W. Ramkete, A.M. Kayastha and V.K. Singh, 2016. MFPPI-Multi FASTA ProtParam Interface. *Bioinformation.*, 12: 74-77.
- Glazebrook, J. 2005. Contrasting mechanisms of defense against biotrophic and necrotrophic pathogens. Ann. Rev. Phytopathol., 43: 205-27.
- Guo, A.Y., Q.H. Zhu, X. Chen and J.C. Luo, 2007. GSDS: a gene structure display server. *Yi Chuan.*, 29(8): 1023-6.
- Hepworth, S.R., Y. Zhang, S. McKim, X. Li and G.W. Haughn, 2005. Blade-On-Petiole-dependent signaling controls leaf and floral patterning in Arabidopsis. *Plant Cell*, 17(5): 1434-48.
- Horton, P., K.J. Park, T. Obayashi, and K. Nakai, 2006. Protein subcellular localization prediction with WoLF PSORT. *In:* Proceedings of the 4th Asia-Pacific bioinformatics conference", pp.39-48. World Scientific.
- Hu, B., J. Jin, A.Y. Guo, H. Zhang, J. Luo and G. Gao, 2015. GSDS 2.0: an upgraded gene features visualization server. *Bioinformatics* 31: 1296-7.
- Initiative, T.A.G., 2000. Analysis of the genome sequence of the flowering plant Arabidopsis thaliana. *Nature.*, 408: 796-815.
- Kim, S.H., F. Gao, S. Bhattacharjee, J.A. Adiasor, J.C. Nam and W. Gassmann, 2010. The Arabidopsis resistance-like gene SNC1 is activated by mutations in SRFR1 and contributes to resistance to the bacterial effector AvrRps4. *P01L4oS Pathog.*, 6. e1001172.
- Kinkema, M., W. Fan and X. Dong, 2000. Nuclear localization of NPR1 is required for activation of PR gene expression. *Plant Cell*, 12(12): 2339-2350.
- Kumar, S., G. Stecher and K. Tamura, 2016. MEGA7: Molecular Evolutionary Genetics Analysis Version 7.0 for Bigger Datasets. *Mol. Biol. Evol.*, 33(7): 1870-4

241

- Letunic, I., R.R. Copley, B. Pils, S. Pinkert, J. Schultz, and P. Bork, 2006. SMART 5: domains in the context of genomes and networks. *Nucleic Acids Res.*, 34(Database issue): D257-60.
- Letunic, I., R.R. Copley, S. Schmidt, F.D. Ciccarelli, T. Doerks, J. Schultz, C.P. Ponting and P. Bork, 2004. SMART 4.0: towards genomic data integration. *Nucleic Acids Res.*, 32(Database issue): D142-4.
- Liu, G., E.B. Holub, J.M. Alonso, J.R. Ecker and P.R. Fobert, 2005. An Arabidopsis NPR1-like gene, NPR4, is required for disease resistance. *Plant J.*, 41(2): 304-18.
- Manohar, M., M. Tian, M. Moreau, S.W. Park, H. Choi, Z. Fei, G. Friso, M. Asif, P. Manosalva and C.C.V. Dahl, 2015. Identification of multiple salicylic acid-binding proteins using two high throughput screens. *Front Plant Sci.*, 5: 777.
- Marchler-Bauer, A., M.K. Derbyshire, N.R. Gonzales, S. Lu, F. Chitsaz, L.Y. Geer, R.C. Geer, J. He, M. Gwadz, D.I. Hurwitz, C.J. Lanczycki, F. Lu, G.H. Marchler, J.S. Song, N. Thanki, Z. Wang, R.A. Yamashita, D. Zhang, C. Zheng and S.H. Bryant, 2015. CDD: NCBI's conserved domain database. *Nucleic Acids Res.*, 43(Database issue): D222-6.
- Marchler-Bauer, A., C. Zheng, F. Chitsaz, M.K. Derbyshire, L.Y. Geer, R.C. Geer, N.R. Gonzales, M. Gwadz, D.I. Hurwitz, C.J. Lanczycki, F. Lu, S. Lu, G.H. Marchler, J.S. Song, N. Thanki, R.A. Yamashita, D. Zhang and S.H. Bryant, 2013. CDD: conserved domains and protein three-dimensional structure. *Nucleic Acids Res.*, 41: D348-52.
- Mou, Z., W. Fan and X. Dong, 2003. Inducers of plant systemic acquired resistance regulate NPR1 function through redox changes. *Cell*, 113(7): 935-44.
- Nair, R., P. Carter and B. Rost, 2003. NLSdb: database of nuclear localization signals. *Nucleic Acids Res.*, 31(1): 397-9.
- Norberg, M., M. Holmlund and O. Nilsson, 2005. The blade on petiole genes act redundantly to control the growth and development of lateral organs. *Development*, 132(9): 2203-13.
- Olate, E., J.M. Jimenez-Gomez, L. Holuigue and J. Salinas, 2018. NPR1 mediates a novel regulatory pathway in cold acclimation by interacting with HSFA1 factors. *Nat. Plants.*, 4(10): 811-823.
- Pieterse, C.M., S.C. van Wees, J.A. van Pelt, M. Knoester, R. Laan, H. Gerrits, P.J. Weisbeek and L.C. van Loon, 1998. A Novel signaling pathway controlling induced systemic resistance in Arabidopsis. *Plant Cell*, 10(9): 1571-80.
- Priest H.D., S.A. Filichkin and T.C. Mockler, 2009. cis-Regulatory elements in plant cell signaling. cis-Regulatory elements in Plant cell signaling. *Curr. Opin. Plant Biol.* 2009., 12: 643-649.
- Rochon, A., P. Boyle, T. Wignes, P.R. Fobert and C. Despres, 2006. The coactivator function of Arabidopsis NPR1 requires the core of its BTB/POZ domain and the oxidation of C-terminal cysteines. *Plant Cell*, 18(12): 3670-3685
- Shah, J., F. Tsui and D.F. Klessig, 1997. Characterization of a salicylic acid-insensitive mutant (sai1) of *Arabidopsis thaliana*, identified in a selective screen utilizing the SA-inducible expression of the tms2 gene. *Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact.*, 10(1): 69-78.
- Shia, Z., S. Maximova, Y. Liua, J. Vericab and M.J. Guiltinan, 2013. The salicylic acid receptor NPR3 is a negative regulator of the transcriptional defense response during early flower development in Arabidopsis. *Mol. Plant.*, 6(3): 802-16.
- Souza, A.A.D., M.A. Takita, H.D. Coletta-Filho, M.A. Campos, J.E.C. Teixeira, M.L.P.N. Targon, E.F. Carlos, J.F. Ravasi, C.N. Fischer and M.A. Machado, 2007. Comparative analysis of differentially expressed sequence tags of sweet orange and mandarin infected with Xylella fastidiosa. *Genetics and Molecular Biology.*, 30: 965-971.
- Spoel, S.H. and X. Dong, 2008. Making sense of hormone crosstalk during plant immune responses. . *Cell Host Microbe.*, 3(6): 348-51.

- Spoel, S.H., A. Koornneef, S.M.C. Claessens, J.P. Korzelius, J.A.V. Pelt, M.J. Mueller, A.J. Buchala, J.P. Métraux, R. Brown, K. Kazan, L.C. Van Loon, X. Dong and C.M. Pieterse, 2003. NPR1 modulates crosstalk between salicylate- and jasmonate-dependent defense pathways through a novel function in the cytosol. . *Plant Cell.*, 15(3): 760-70.
- Swingle, W.T. and P.C. Reece, 1967. The Citrus Industry. University of California Press, Berkeley, California, USA, 2nd edn. Vol. 1: 190-430.
- Tada, Y., S.H. Spoel, K. Pajerowska-Mukhtar, Z. Mou, J. Song, C. Wang, J. Zuo and X., Dong, 2008. Plant immunity requires conformational changes of NPR1 via. S-nitrosylation and thioredoxins. . Science, 321(5891): 952-6.
- Thompson, J.D., T.J. Gibson and D.G. Higgins, 2002. Multiple sequence alignment using ClustalW and ClustalX. *Curr Protoc Bioinformatics*, Chapter 2: Unit 2.3.
- Timmer L.W., S.N. Mondal, N.A.R. Peres and A. Bhatia 2004. Fungal Diseases of Fruit and Foliage of Citrus Trees. *In* "In: Naqvi S.A.M.H. (eds) Diseases of Fruits and Vegetables ", Vol. I. Springer, Dordrecht.
- Tripathi, D., G. Raikhy and D. Kumar, 2019. Chemical elicitors of systemic acquired resistance—Salicylic acid and its functional analogs. . *Curr. Plant Biol.*, 17: 48-59.
- Wang, L., F. He, Y. Huang, J. He, S. Yang, J. Zeng, C. Deng, X. Jiang, Y. Fang, S. Wen, R. Xu, H. Yu, X. Yang, G. Zhong, C. Chen, X. Yan, C. Zhou, H. Zhang, Z. Xie, R.M. Larkin, X. Deng and Q. Xu, 2018. Genome of Wild Mandarin and Domestication History of Mandarin. *Mol. Plant.*, 11: 1024-1037.
- Wang, X., B. Yang, K. Li, Z. Kang, D. Cantu and J. Dubcovsky, 2016. A conserved Puccinia striiformis protein interacts with wheat NPR1 and reduces induction of pathogenesis-related genes in response to pathogens. *Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact.*, 29(12): 977-989.
- Wu, G.A., J. Terol, V. Ibanez, A. Lopez-Garcia, E. Perez-Roman, C. Borreda, C. Domingo, F.R. Tadeo, J. Carbonell-Caballero, R. Alonso, F. Curk, D. Du, P. Ollitrault, M.L. Roose, J. Dopazo, F.G. Gmitter, D.S. Rokhsar and Talon, 2018. Genomics of the origin and evolution of Citrus. *Nature*, 554(7692): 311-316.
- Wu, Y., D. Zhang, Chu, J.Y. Boyle, P.; Wang, Y. Brindle, I.D. Luca, V.D.; Despres, C., 2012. The Arabidopsis NPR1 protein is a receptor for the plant defense hormone salicylic acid. *Cell Rep.*,1(6): 639-47
- Yang, Z., X. Wang, J. Xue, L. Meng and Li, 2013. Identification and expression analysis of WRKY transcription factors in medicinal plant *Catharanthus roseus*. *Sheng Wu Gong Cheng Xue Bao.*, 29(6): 785-802.
- Yu, D., C. Chen and Z. Chen, 2001. Evidence for an important role of WRKY DNA binding proteins in the regulation of NPR1 gene expression. *Plant Cell*, 13(7): 1527-1539.
- Yuan, Y., S. Zhong, Q. Li, Z. Zhu, Y. Lou, L. Wang, J. Wang, M. Wang, Q. Li, D. Yang and Z. He, 2007. Functional analysis of rice NPR1-like genes reveals that OsNPR1/NH1 is the rice orthologue conferring disease resistance with enhanced herbivore susceptibility. *Plant Biotechnol. J.*, 5(2): 313-24.
- Zhang, Y., Y.T. Cheng, N. Qu, Q. Zhao, D. Bi and X. Li, 2006. Negative regulation of defense responses in Arabidopsis by two NPR1 paralogs. *Plant J.*, 48(5): 647-656.
- Zhang, Y. and X. Li, 2019. Salicylic acid: Biosynthesis, perception, and contributions to plant immunity. *Curr. Opin. Plant Biol.*, 50: 29-36.
- Zhong, X., L. Xi, Q. Lian, X. Luo, Z. Wu, S. Seng, X. Yuan and M. Yi, 2015. The NPR1 homolog GhNPR1 plays an important role in the defense response of Gladiolus hybridus. *Plant Cell Rep.*, 10: 102.
- Zipfel, C., S. Robatzek, L. Navarro, E.J. Oakeley, J.D.G. Jones, G. Felix and T. Boller, 2004. Bacterial disease resistance in Arabidopsis through flagellin perception. *Nature*, 428(6984): 764-7.

Received: March, 2021; Revised: May, 2021; Accepted: June, 2021